

SPICE Lesson-Writing Guide

Organizing Questions

- Who do cultural artifacts belong to?
- What is the purpose of preserving historical artifacts?
- Can artifacts in museums be considered stolen?

Introduction

In this lesson, students will be holding a mock trial to decide whether foreign explorers from the late 1800s to early 1900s are guilty of stealing artifacts from the Mogao Caves. They will be divided into groups and given background readings to familiarize themselves with their part. Then, each group will testify, giving their opinion on whether or not the explorers are guilty. The groups not presenting will take notes on the presentations. Then, we will vote to determine the guilt of the explorers. The lesson will wrap-up with students dropping their personas and having a discussion where they are not bound to the perspective of their assigned group. We will discuss honestly whether or not we believe the explorers should face blame for their actions. For homework, students will write a paragraph where they summarize their opinion on the matter.

Objectives

- Close read a passage and pull out main ideas (skill)
- Develop a claim-evidence-analysis to support their position (skill)
- Present in front of their classmates (skill)
- Understand the complexities of ownership of historical artifacts (attitude)
- Understand the history of the Mogao Caves and the different roles of groups in the Mogao Caves (knowledge)
- Conclude that ownership of historical artifacts is murky and difficult to parse out (attitude)

1. List all materials a teacher would need to execute this lesson, including printed materials (e.g., handouts, readings, maps, photos, answer keys, background information for the teacher, DVDs) and physical classroom materials (e.g., tape, scissors, poster board, stopwatch). Be specific. □

- Background information handout on Mogao Caves
- Identity handouts for each of the four groups (20 total)
- note-taking graphic organizers for all students (20 total)
- Testimony Graphic Organizer
- writing implements for students
- Markers for testimony visual

Equipment

List any equipment needed (e.g., TV, DVD player, computer with Internet access, computer with projector, etc.)

- Laptop with internet access
- Projector
- Speakers
- Poster paper x4

Teacher Preparation

- Set up laptop and projector
 - Test video with speakers
- Copy articles
- Create model

Time

3 50-minutes class periods

Procedures

1. This is the meat of the lesson. List step-by-step instructions describing how to run your lesson. Instructions should be clear and specific enough so that any teacher would be able to follow the procedures easily. □
2. Try to begin each procedure with a directive of some sort. (e.g., begin, conclude, debrief, discuss, display, distribute, divide (the class into small groups), explain, inform, instruct, lead (a discussion), point out, view (the lecture), etc.) □
3. Try to keep steps relatively short. It's better to have many short, discrete steps than only a few very long steps. □
4. Conclude your lesson with some sort of debriefing activity, whether it is a discussion, writing assignment, quiz, etc. □
5. When debriefing the lesson, be sure to revisit the organizing questions posed at the beginning of the lesson. □

Day 1: Set the Stage

- (10 minutes) Do Now: What is a trial? What are they designed to do?
 - Students will write their responses in their notebooks and then share with their table group before a voluntary class share
 - We will decide:
 - a trial is formal
 - Judges, juries (sometimes), and lawyers (sometimes) are involved

- The **purpose** of a trial is to decide if a person or group of people is/are **guilty** or **innocent** of a crime
- (10 minutes) Mini-lesson: background information
 - Teacher will introduce topic by explaining to the class that we have been called in to solve a crime, but we need to understand the background of the situation
 - play the video from the “foreign correspondent”
- (5 minutes) Introduce Identities
 - Divide the class into 4 groups
 - Foreign Explorers
 - Buddhist Monks
 - British Museum curators
 - Chinese government officials
- (20 minutes) Group Work Time
 - Students will work in their groups to complete their briefing document and graphic organizer
 - They will work to decided how their group would feel about the guilt or innocence of the explorers
- (5 minutes) Debrief
 - Students will share out what they have learned
 - What was surprising? What was interesting?

Day 2: The Trial!

- (5 minutes) Do Now: What does your group think: Were the explorers guilty or innocent of stealing artifacts from the Mogao Caves?
- (20 minutes) Prepare your presentation
 - Students will work in their groups to decide whether they think the explorers are guilty or innocent
 - Students will fulfill group roles to help keep them focused and on-task
 - Presenter
 - Facilitator
 - Timekeeper/Scribe
 - Questioner
 - Students will develop a claim, at least three pieces of evidence, and analysis following the CEA structure we use in class
 - They will create a briefing sheet on poster paper of 3 main reasons why they believe what they do
- (20 minutes) Testimony
 - Students will present their cases as to whether the explorers are guilty or innocent
 - During presentations, the other students will fill in a graphic organizer
- (5 minutes)Vote and Give discussion questions to complete for homework

Day 3: Discussion and Debrief

- Discussion questions
 - (5 min) Do Now: Which discussion question do you want to start with and why?
 - (30 min) Students will vote on which question they want to start with, and then we will complete a **three-finger discussion**
 - All students start with three fingers up. Every time a student speaks, they will put one finger down. This way, students work to balance their commentary and no student can dominate the conversation.
 - What do you think? Without taking your group identity into consideration, do you think what the foreign explorers did was stealing? Why? It's ok to take a middle position.
 - Who do historical artifacts belong to? The people who created them? The people who find them? Someone else? Why?
 - What do you think should be done with the Mogao Artifacts? Should they be returned China? Left where they are? Another solution? Why?
 - (15 min) Discussion Debrief and paragraph prompt
 - Write a paragraph where you answer the question: Who does history belong to?
 - Students will complete paragraph for HW

Assessment

1. Once you've finished writing the lesson, go back and find all the items that can be collected for assessment. List the items for assessment in the same order that they appear in the lesson. □

2. Provide assessment criteria wherever possible. If you have rubrics you use, include them as attachments. □

- Testimony Visual Aid
- Discussion Participation
- Paragraph Response

Bibliography:

<http://chinalawandpolicy.com/tag/mogao-caves/>

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/arts/0/24624407>

<http://blogs.getty.edu/iris/14-facts-cave-temples-dunhuang/>

<http://www.chinahighlights.com/dunhuang/attraction/mogao-grottoes.htm>

<http://shahon.org/wp-content/uploads/2011/06/The-third-Otani-expedition-at-Dunhuang.pdf>

“Foreign Devils on the Silk Road” Peter Hopkins

Lesson Materials Start on the Next Page

Buddhist Monks



Of all the travellers on the Silk Road, Buddhist monks were less interested in trading goods than they were in trading ideas. Buddhism spread from India to China in the 6th century BCE. The Han emperor Ming-Ti sent a messenger to India to learn about Buddhism. He returned after a long journey with Indian Buddhist priests who brought with them Buddhist texts called **sutras** (soo-truhs) and Buddhist art. The Chinese loved the beautiful art and the influence of Indian painting and sculpture began to appear in Chinese art. Additionally, many Chinese people began to follow the teachings of the Buddha, and eventually Buddhism joined Daoism as a major Chinese belief system.

Chinese Buddhist monks began to travel the Silk Road to spread their beliefs to the travelers they met. They set up monasteries where **weary** (tired) travelers could rest. Often, the rooms were carved directly into the mountainsides to escape the desert heat. The most famous of these caves are the Mogao Caves. The story goes that in 366 CE, a monk named Yue Zun dreamed of 1,000 buddhas, and when he woke up he painted them on the walls and ceiling of his cave **chamber** (room). Over time, more and more paintings were created in Mogao, becoming more detailed and elaborate. Eventually, wealthy families and **merchants** (people who buy and sell things) would donate money to the monasteries to help give them good luck or to protect them from the dangers of the Silk Road. This money was used to decorate caves with paintings and statues, and to create documents with written sutras. Eventually, over 400 caves were created at Mogao until construction stopped during the Yuan Dynasty in the 14th century.

For the Buddhist monks at Mogao, the caves represented a wealth of knowledge as well as a place of great holiness. They reproduced stories like the Jataka Tales on the walls. They told stories about the Buddha and his good deeds, as well as stories about how Buddhism could help people. Many caves feature the Buddha and his disciples, known as *arhats* and other sacred beings that are incredibly important to Buddhist thinking. The monks occasionally used the caves as places for meditation and for them, the caves were a sacred place where the teachings of the Buddha came to life in beautiful wall paintings, detailed sculptures, and sacred texts. The monks might not look favorably upon anyone who damaged or removed any artifacts. Then again, they might appreciate their artwork being shared with world. What do you think?

Chinese Government

In order to understand the Chinese government's perspective, a few different time periods must be understood. At the time that the caves were rediscovered in the late 1800s and early 1900s, Buddhism was less popular in China. Most government officials were Confucianist, and they weren't particularly interested in Buddhist art. When Wang Yuanlu, the Daoist priest who first worked to restore the caves, approached the Chinese government for money to help with his restoration, they refused, and suggested he board the caves back up. At the time, they couldn't expect the magnitude (largeness) of the find or how precious some of the artifacts would turn out to be. Additionally, China was recovering from a very difficult 19th century, and had less interest in creating museums to honor the past or in developing a thriving museum culture. In general, they mostly didn't care when foreign explorers began journeying to Dunhuang.



Things can change quickly, however. Once the Chinese government realized how valuable the items being removed from the caves were, and how many items had been taken, they worked to put a stop to it. Many Chinese people were already suspicious of foreigners, but learning that they were removing Chinese history from

the caves made it worse. In 1925, Langdon Warner decided to return to Dunhuang to remove even more wall paintings, using a glue-like liquid that could peel the paintings right off the wall. He was unable to work at all, however, because a mob of angry farmers blocked his path to the caves. Eventually, he had to return to the United States empty-handed and explain to the Fogg Museum at Harvard that he was unsuccessful.

The Fogg Museum tried again, this time hiring famed explorer Aurel Stein to try to succeed where Warner had failed. Stein was very well-respected in China, but he couldn't **obtain** (get) the necessary permission to go into Dunhuang, and the National Council for the Preservation of Chinese Antiquities and the Chinese **press** (newspapers and media) publicly spoke against him and his missions to Dunhuang. The idea that China did not care about the Mogao artwork was certainly over at this point.

Unfortunately, by the time the Chinese government realized that the Mogao artwork should stay in China, it was too late for hundreds of paintings and documents. They were distributed over more than 12 countries and often so spread out that it would be nearly impossible (not to mention, incredibly expensive) to return them all to China.

The modern Chinese government is working hard to preserve the existing caves. They are promoting the Mogao Caves as a tourist attraction and have partnered with the Getty in Los Angeles to create 5 replica caves, exact copies that it takes teams of artists years to create. They are using these replica caves to travel the world to educate other places about the beautiful artwork found in Dunhuang. You might think that the Chinese government has put the past behind them, and no longer bear any ill will towards the foreign explorers for their removal of artwork. However, one of the caves chosen to be reproduced and travel the world was number 323. Cave 323 is a beautiful cave like all the others, with one detail none of the other replicas have: a big white scar on one of the walls where a painting had been removed, a remnant of Langdon Warner's visit to the caves. Maybe the Chinese government wants to remind people that they haven't quite forgotten the foreign explorers' visits to Dunhuang.



Foreign Explorers

When Wang Yuanlu, a Daoist priest, found the documents in the Library Cave, a hidden side chamber of a different cave, he knew they were important, though he wasn't exactly sure what they were. He reported his findings to the local government, who at the time were mostly Confucian **elites** (high-class people) who didn't care for Buddhism. They had no interest in the Buddhist writings in the cave and told him to close the room. However, word spread that there were a large number of ancient documents and art in a small **oasis** (area with water) town in the middle of the Gobi Desert. Eventually, it spread to the ears of foreign explorers like Aurel Stein from Hungary, American Langdon Warner, and Japanese Kozui Otani, who all began to move towards the Mogao Caves and their treasures. All these explorers eventually reached the caves, and they all removed artifacts, though some more delicately than others.



The first to arrive was **Aurel Stein** (Or-ull Stine), a scholar and explorer, in 1901. Stein heard about the Library Cave and immediately headed to Dunhuang. He met with Wang, who did not want to give him the manuscripts. Stein was not ready to give up, however, and he managed to persuade Wang that Hsuan-tsang (Sooan-sang), an early Chinese Buddhist monk who Wang loved, would have wanted Stein to have the documents. Feeling reassured that he was doing the right thing, Wang sold Stein 25 cases of priceless manuscripts, and 5 cases of paintings for around 170 US dollars. These artifacts can still be viewed today in the British Museum in London.



In 1913, the American **Langdon Warner** arrived at the caves. A Harvard archaeology professor and a bit of a daredevil, Warner is largely believed to be the inspiration for Indiana Jones (ask your parents who that is). After seeing Stein's Dunhuang artifacts at the British Museum, he wanted to see the originals in person. When he arrived, however, he was horrified. In 1911, Russian soldiers had been temporarily imprisoned in the caves. Obviously bored, some of them passed the time by vandalizing the caves. They wrote their names and other graffiti over priceless paintings, and even cooked inside the caves, the smoke from their fires blackening the art beyond recognition. Warner was enraged, and vowed to bring back as much art as he could, in order to protect it from further damage. Stein had taken documents and paintings on silk and parchment. But Warner came with the

latest technological advance: a liquid that could remove the caves' most beautiful artwork directly from where it had been painted on the walls. He was unprepared for the weather conditions of the caves, however, and in a few cases, the liquid actually destroyed the painting. Even in the cases where he was successful, large white spaces were left behind where he removed the art (picture above). Most of Warner's finds are on exhibit at Harvard's Fogg Gallery

The most mysterious foreign explorer was a Japanese aristocrat, **Count Kozui Otani** (Koh-zoo-ee Oh-tahn-ee). Count Otani was the leader of the Pure Land group, a Japanese version of Buddhism. He heard about the Buddhist treasures of the Silk Road and sent two men to research them further in 1902 and 1908.



The men went to Dunhuang in 1911 and purchased at least 200 scrolls from the Mogao Caves from Wang Yuanlu, the priest who was the unofficial guardian of the cave. Then the two men went back to Japan and gave the manuscripts to Count Otani in Kyoto. What happened to those scrolls after their arrival in Japan largely remains a mystery. Some were given to the Kyoto Museum. Some remain in the hands of a wealthy private collectors. The rest seem to have simply disappeared. But the mystery doesn't end there. There are many who don't think Count Otani was just a religious leader looking to purchase the writings of his spiritual ancestors. Many think that Otani and his men were

spies, gathering intelligence on the Europeans and Chinese in Dunhuang. The fact remains, that due to Otani's missions, many priceless scrolls are currently missing.

Museum Curators

Curator: person who designs museum exhibitions and cares for museum artifacts

When the foreign explorers brought their artifacts back from the Mogao Caves, most of them went to museums, the British Museum for Stein, Harvard's Fogg Museum for Warner, and the Kyoto Museum for some of Otani's artifacts. In many cases, like Warner's, the museums had actually paid for the explorers to go to Dunhuang and bring back the artifacts. The museums and their curators recognized the importance of these artifacts and rushed to display them to a public who was largely unfamiliar with Chinese Buddhist art.



Many of Warner and Stein's artifacts are **prominently** (centrally) displayed in the Fogg Museum and British Museum. People are much more likely to visit these museums than they are to travel to Dunhuang and therefore, these artifacts are seen by many more people than they would if they were still in the caves. In 2016, it is predicted that over 1 million people will visit the Mogao Caves mostly Chinese tourists. That is certainly a lot of people, but in 2014, 6.7 million people visited the British Museum alone, from all

over the world, with hundreds of thousands more seeing artifacts at the Fogg Museum. Museums also do outreach at schools, upload resources to the internet, and can loan their artifacts to other museums. For example, in 2016, the British Museum loaned Dunhuang artifacts to the Getty Museum in Los Angeles, which created a special temporary exhibit to house the artifacts, allowing a completely different audience to experience them. Museums like the Getty and the British Museums have millions of dollars and staffs of highly trained curators, historians, and professionals who are able to care for the delicate artifacts in a way that Dunhuang was not able to in the early 1900s and is only just becoming able to in the present.

However, not all the artifacts are on display. Museums are limited by space, and the British Museum has one of the largest collections in the world. They simply aren't able to show all the artifacts they have, and they have to rotate their collections to keep the public interested. Many priceless, one of a kind artifacts remain in the storage facilities of the museums, protected in carefully climate-controlled rooms, but unavailable for public view.



Additionally, there is the small matter of price. All the explorers paid for their purchases, and many of the museums even have receipts from the documents. In most cases, a receipt is final proof that something isn't stolen. However, it's a little more complicated than that. While the explorers certainly paid for the artifacts, they purchased many of them from Wang Yuanlu, a Daoist priest who was working to protect the caves. Though he understood that the documents, paintings, and statues were valuable, he could not have known exactly how valuable. Aurel Stein paid about \$170 for 25 cases of documents, including the Diamond Sutra, the world's very first printed book, created around 800 CE. Today, the artifacts are not for sale, but it can be estimated that it would be worth tens, if not hundreds of millions of dollars. Though they couldn't know exactly how much, Stein and Warner certainly understood that their finds were worth more than they paid for them at the time.

There is very little chance that the museum curators will return the artifacts to China at this time. However, they recognize the importance of the finds to China's history and culture and are working to find a solution. Currently, the museums that house the collections of artifacts from the Mogao Caves are working to bring the collection back together, while still allowing international audiences to see the work. They are working on the International Dunhuang Project, where each museum scans the artifacts they have and uploads them to an online database that can be accessed by scholars seeking to learn more about the Mogao Caves.

Setting Up Your Testimony

Use this sheet to work with your group to brainstorm ideas for your testimony. Every group member needs to have this sheet filled out, even though your scribe will be responsible for planning your poster.

Claim (1-2 sentences):

Optional structure: "The foreign explorers are guilty/innocent of stealing the Mogao artifacts because..."

Evidence (at least three pieces, can be bullet points) Why is your claim correct? Pick evidence from the background article and your briefing sheet:

Optional structure: "It is clear that..." "The evidence supports our claim because..."

Analysis (1-2 complete sentences):

Optional structure: "This is important because..."

Things to remember: This is a court! You must be **formal** and **persuasive**. You must convince your audience that the suspects are guilty or innocent. Whenever possible, use academic vocabulary to show your credibility and professionalism!

Examples of good persuading words/phrases:

- Clearly...
- It is obvious that...
- The evidence shows...
- As you can see...
- For instance...

Presentation Graphic Organizer

Directions: Fill in this graphic organizer while the other groups are presenting. Wait to fill in the third box until they are done! You do not have to fill in a box for your group.

Group Name	Guilty or Innocent ? (G/I)	3 Main Points (in your own words, incomplete sentences are fine)	After the presentation: What do you think about this group's points? What do you agree with? What do you disagree with?

Discussion Questions

Respond to each of the following questions in at least five sentences.

1. What do you think? Without taking your group identity into consideration, do you think what the foreign explorers did was stealing? Why? It's ok to take a middle position.

2. Who do historical artifacts belong to? The people who created them? The people who find them? Someone else? Why?

3. What do you think should be done with the Mogao Artifacts? Should they be returned China? Left where they are? Another solution? Why?
