

Institute on China  
Group Projects Abroad  
Fulbright-Hays UC Berkeley

**Balancing Economic Growth and Community:  
A Comparison of Dunhuang, China and the San Francisco-Bay Area**

Kelsey Theriault  
Woodside High School  
Woodside, California

**Grade Level**

12th Grade Economics and Government

**Organizing Questions**

**Broad Lesson Question:** How do communities balance economic growth while maintaining the identity and quality of life of the community?

**Dunhuang:** How should Dunhuang, China balance promoting economic growth and tourism while preserving the culture, history, and community in the region?

- a. How will a boost in tourism and economic development impact Dunhuang?
- b. What are possible solutions to deal with these issues in the best interest of the community?

**Bay Area:** How can [Redwood City, East Palo Alto, or San Francisco] promote economic growth while effectively addressing issues of gentrification?

- c. How is gentrification and the growth of the tech industry impacting the community of [Redwood City, East Palo Alto, or San Francisco]?
- d. What are some possible solutions to balance community and identity with economic growth?

**Introduction**

With the influences globalization, migration, and economic development, many communities are seeing huge shifts the 21st century. Jobs are changings, some industries are expanding rapidly while others are declining, and many cities are experiencing both positive growth and tensions that come from these changes. Many cities in the San Francisco-Bay Area are dealing with issues around gentrification and affordable housing as the tech industry is

expanding and paying high salaries that other industries can't keep up with. The city where my school is located, Redwood City, is seeing recent, rapid growth in the tech industry as many companies are moving to the area and their employees are paying premiums for housing. Another town where students at Woodside High School come from is East Palo Alto (EPA), a historically lower-income and more racially diverse town than neighboring Palo Alto and Menlo Park. With the move of tech companies like Facebook to the area, residents in EPA are also feeling the tensions of gentrification and affordable housing. With the economic growth, many longtime residents are being pushed out and the sense of community is changing dramatically.

Many students at Woodside (and in towns throughout the SF-Bay Area) have stories about how their communities are changing, how their families have been evicted, or how they had move because of housing prices. In 12th grade Economics and Government, I tie issues of gentrification and housing to globalization, supply and demand, and social welfare, and students connect to the lesson because it relates to their home.

I am connecting the issues in the SF-Bay Area to Dunhuang, China because of the current boom in development in Dunhuang due to the "One Road, One Belt" policy, the upcoming international expo in September 2016, and the sharp increase in tourism due to the Mogao Caves. With this rapid increase in development and tourism comes issues with members of the community being pushed out, farmland being taken over by construction, and the history and culture of the region being exploited for profit. Though the form in which the issues manifest themselves are different, the big issue boils down to how a community can balance economic development with the identity and quality of life valued by the community. Because of the common theme between the issues occurring in the SF-Bay Area and Dunhuang, China, I will have my students compare the issues, explore possible solutions, and then decide on the best solutions for both communities by creating a proposal that addresses future steps for each city.

I shaped this lesson to be specific to the community in which I teach, as well as Dunhuang, China, to enhance student engagement and to give students a global perspective relative to place they live. My goal is for my students to make connections between the issues in their own community with other communities around the world. Some students may live in Redwood City for the rest of their lives, and others may move around the world. I want them to be able to recognize the commonalities in communities around the world and be able to engage as global citizens, wherever they end up. This lesson can be changed to reflect any city that is dealing with issues of gentrification and displacement. These issues are not exclusive to the SF-Bay Area and many students around the US (and the world) can see these issues within their communities.

## Objectives

Students will be able to:

1. **Describe** the impact of tourism and economic growth in Dunhuang and the impact of gentrification and the growth of the tech industry in [Redwood City, East Palo Alto, or San Francisco].
2. **Analyze** best practices, based on research, to manage these issues while promoting economic development that is in the best interest of the people.
3. **Create** a proposal for solutions to issues in Dunhuang and SF-Bay Area.
4. **Explain** how we see similar issues to the SF-Bay Area globally by writing an analytical essay using evidence from multiple sources.

## Common Core Standards

### CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RH.11-12.7

Integrate and evaluate multiple sources of information presented in diverse formats and media (e.g., visually, quantitatively, as well as in words) in order to address a question or solve a problem.

### CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.W.11-12.6

Use technology, including the Internet, to produce, publish, and update individual or shared writing products in response to ongoing feedback, including new arguments or information.

### CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.W.11-12.7

Conduct short as well as more sustained research projects to answer a question (including a self-generated question) or solve a problem; narrow or broaden the inquiry when appropriate; synthesize multiple sources on the subject, demonstrating understanding of the subject under investigation.

### CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.W.11-12.8

Gather relevant information from multiple authoritative print and digital sources, using advanced searches effectively; assess the strengths and limitations of each source in terms of the task, purpose, and audience; integrate information into the text selectively to maintain the flow of ideas, avoiding plagiarism and overreliance on any one source and following a standard format for citation.

## Materials

### General

Post-it Notes

Manilla Folder (for group materials)

Poster paper

### Dunhuang, China

[Peking University study on the perceptions of tourism in Dunhuang from local residents](#)

Excerpts from [Strategies for Sustainable Tourism at the Mogao Grottoes of Dunhuang, China](#)

NY Times article [“Plan for Theme Park at Centuries-Old Chinese Caves Rattles Preservationists”](#)

NY Times article [“A Crescent of Water is Slowly Sinking into the Desert”](#)

SF-Bay Area

[“Million Dollar Shack”](#) video

[Documents about Gentrification in Bay Area](#) (2)

[UC-Berkeley’s Urban Displacement Studies](#) (Redwood City, EPA, SF, etc.)

## **Equipment**

Chromebooks (or access to any class computers)

## **Teacher Preparation**

Prior to implementing this lesson, teachers should have a solid understanding of the history of the Mogao Caves and the city of Dunhuang (it’s prominence on Silk Road), as well as a general understanding about the impact of gentrification in the Bay Area. Many of the sources provided to students, such as *Strategies for Sustainable Tourism* and the UC Berkeley Urban Displacement studies will help teachers build a solid base of context to implement this lesson.

In the classroom, teachers should make sure that students also know the general background of the Mogao Caves and Dunhuang prior to implementation. A general lesson about this context could be completed the class before.

Additional Resources: [Articles from the Getty about preservation of caves in Dunhuang](#)

## **Time**

3 block periods (95 minutes) or 5-6 regular periods (50 minutes)

## **Procedures**

See attached Lesson Plans 1-3

## **Assessment**

Summative assessment: Students will write a 5-paragraph position paper (DBQ) arguing their stance on the broad question: **How do communities balance economic growth while maintaining the identity and quality of life of the community?**

Students will use information from their research (from at least 4 sources) with proper citations to support their claim.



## Lesson Plan #1

Block period 95 minutes

<b>Lesson Topic</b>	Balancing Economic Growth with Community in Dunhuang, China
<b>Lesson Objectives</b>	Students will be able to: <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Understand the importance of Dunhuang within Chinese history and the issues Dunhuang is facing today, as well as the goals of “One Road, One Belt”</li><li>2. Describe the most significant issues related to economic growth and community facing Dunhuang today</li><li>3. Analyze and present possible solutions for the issues Dunhuang is facing</li></ol>
<b>Lesson Questions</b>	How should Dunhuang, China balance promoting economic growth and tourism while preserving the culture, history, and community in the region? <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>a. How will a boost in tourism and the “One Road, One Belt” initiative impact Dunhuang?</li><li>b. What are possible solutions to deal with these issues in the best interest of the community?</li></ol>
<b>Kickoff</b>	<p><b>5 minutes</b></p> <p>“What are some potential of benefits of tourism in a city? What are some potential issues?”</p> <p>Students brainstorm on their own for 2 minutes. Then, share out with their partner and come up with a comprehensive list.</p> <p>Call on students to share out benefits/issues with tourism and use as segway into lecture about Dunhuang.</p>
<b>Lesson Segments</b>	<p><b>15 minutes -- Context and Background Notes</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>→ Students will take notes (cloze notes) on the relevant background information related to Dunhuang, Mogao Caves, tourism, “One Road, One Belt”, and the possible problems.</li></ul> <p><b>20 minutes -- Group Close Read/ Jigsaw</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>→ Teacher creates (or students self-select) groups of 2-3.</li><li>→ Students will read 2 of the provided articles (groups of 3 will have more than one person reading the same article)</li><li>→ Students read and annotate<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>◆ Provide annotation sample (example: star next to a problem, underline why it’s a problem, circle a proposed solution, if provided)</li></ul></li></ul>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>◆ Or allow students to annotate in whatever way they prefer as long as they look for the above three ideas</li> <li>→ Students write down two major problems for Dunhuang that they read about on the post it notes</li> </ul> <p><b>10 minutes -- Share out and discussion</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>→ Each student shares out 1 minute summary of main points of readings as well as the 2 issues identified for Dunhuang</li> <li>→ After all students share out, the group discusses which 2-3 issues they will focus on and decide on some possible solutions based on the readings, as well as any additional research they would like to do on the Chromebooks</li> </ul> <p><b>30 minutes -- Poster Creation</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>→ Groups create a poster outlining the issue and potential solutions.</li> <li>→ Encourage students to provide reasoning for why their solutions will work.</li> <li>→ Students can include both visual and textual evidence on the poster to explain their reasoning to classmates</li> </ul>
<b>Wrap up/ Assessment</b>	<p><b>15 minutes</b></p> <p>Students do a gallery walk for posters and write positive and specific feedback for two groups based on their issues identified for Dunhuang and the solutions proposed.</p>

## Lesson Plan #2

Block period 95 minutes

<b>Lesson Topic</b>	Issues of Gentrification in the SF-Bay Area
<b>Lesson Objectives</b>	Students will be able to: <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Identify ways in which gentrification is impacting the SF-Bay Area and describe the impact on the community</li><li>2. Synthesize research and propose ideas for solving broad community issues</li><li>3. Articulate ideas in a formal, academic way</li></ol>
<b>Lesson Questions</b>	<i>Bay Area:</i> How can [Redwood City, East Palo Alto, or San Francisco] promote economic growth while effectively addressing issues of gentrification? <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>a. How is gentrification and the growth of the tech industry impacting the community of [Redwood City, East Palo Alto, or San Francisco]?</li><li>b. What are some possible solutions to balance community and identity with economic growth?</li></ol>
<b>Kickoff</b>	<p><b>5 minutes</b></p> <p>“In what ways has the community where you live changed over time?” “<i>Example: I live in San Francisco and many people are moving away because rent prices are increasing significantly each year.</i>”</p> <p>Students will write a 1-2 sentence response explaining ways in which their communities have changed over time.</p> <p>Students share out to class.</p>
<b>Lesson Segments</b>	<p><b>10 minutes - Clips from “Million Dollar Shack”</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>→ Students view video about issues of housing prices and community displacement in the short video.<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>◆ Could show the whole video if there is time (about 30 minutes)</li></ul></li><li>→ Students take notes on the issues outlined in the video as well as any personal reactions or personal connections to the issues.<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>◆ Ask a few students to share out what surprised them or any personal reactions/stories</li></ul></li></ul> <p><b>5 minutes - Background Information</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>→ PowerPoint presentation w/ cloze notes that outlines</li></ul>



	<p>gentrification statistics from RWC, EPA, and SF.  → Present focus question and task</p> <p><b>45 minutes - Research and Outline of Issues</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>→ Students work in groups of 2-3 and research their chosen city and the issues the community is facing specific to gentrification.</li> <li>→ Guide students through the UC Berkeley website and how to read the report.</li> <li>→ Students will decide on 3 or more issues to focus on (should focus on no more than 5) and describe these issues. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>◆ What are the issues?</li> <li>◆ How are these issues impacting the community?</li> <li>◆ What is the cause/causes of these issues?</li> <li>◆ Who is it impacting?</li> </ul> </li> <li>→ Students should work on a Google Doc to organize their ideas.</li> </ul> <p><b>10 minutes - Class Brainstorm</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>→ Bring the class back together and have each group write 2 issues that they are focusing on for their city on the whiteboard.</li> <li>→ Have students quietly read through and discuss with their group the commonalities as well as any suggestions they have at this point for addressing any of these issues (their research should lead them to make some initial claims for how to address these issues).</li> <li>→ Last 4-5 minutes: ask a few groups to share out initial thoughts with the entire class.</li> </ul> <p><b>15 minutes - Begin drafting proposal</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>→ Students begin drafting letter/proposal to city council that includes suggestions for how to best address the issues in the community <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>◆ What are some ways to deal with issue?</li> <li>◆ Why is this solution going to help?</li> <li>◆ Describe exactly how this solution will help.</li> </ul> </li> <li>→ Remind students that they can (and should) continue to do research on the Chromebooks during this section of the lesson</li> </ul>
<p><b>Wrap up/ Assessment</b></p>	<p><b>5 minutes - Wrap up</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>→ Groups should make note of where they are stopping and where they plan to begin on the next class.</li> </ul> <p>**Make sure students share document with teacher for grading.</p>

Block period 95 minutes

<b>Lesson Topic</b>	Proposed Solutions for Global Community Issues
<b>Lesson Objectives</b>	Students will be able to: <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Create proposals for city council to address gentrification issues in the community</li><li>2. Present ideas in an oral, academic setting</li><li>3. Synthesize ideas about economic growth and community based on study of Dunhuang, China and the SF-Bay Area using research</li></ol>
<b>Lesson Questions</b>	<p><i>Bay Area:</i> How can [Redwood City, East Palo Alto, or San Francisco] promote economic growth while effectively addressing issues of gentrification?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>a. What are some possible solutions to balance community and identity with economic growth?</li></ol> <p><b><i>Broad Lesson Question:</i></b> How do communities balance economic growth while maintaining the identity and quality of life of the community?</p>
<b>Kickoff</b>	<p><b>5 minutes</b></p> <p>“Why is it important to be active members of your community and in what ways can you be an active member of your community now?”</p> <p>Students will write a short response, share with partner, and then share out to class.</p>
<b>Lesson Segments</b>	<p><b>30 minutes - Finish proposals</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>→ Students meet with their groups to continue where they left off after the last day.</li><li>→ Students will complete their proposals in class today.</li></ul> <p><b>10 minutes - Prepare 1 minute presentation</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>→ Ask each group to share out one of their issues and the way they are proposing to address the issue.</li><li>→ All group members must speak.</li><li>→ If they have time, they could prepare a slide to share in addition to an oral presentation.</li></ul> <p><b>15 minutes - Groups share out in Presentations</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>→ Each group shares for a minute, then the class may ask questions about proposal.</li></ul> <p><b>10 minutes - Revise proposals</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>→ Give students time to revise proposals based on</li></ul>

	<p>questions/feedback from classmates.</p> <p>→ Students will submit final draft at this point.</p>
<b>Wrap up/ Assessment</b>	<p><b>25 minutes - Preliminary paragraph response to question</b></p> <p>→ Students will respond to the <b><i>Broad Lesson Question</i></b> in 1-2 preliminary paragraphs thinking about how both the SF-Bay Area and Dunhuang, China are struggling with balancing economic growth and community and ways to address these issues.</p> <p>→ Students will eventually write a 5-paragraph essay on this topic, so teacher can provide feedback on early shorter draft to ensure students are using evidence and fully answering question.</p>